Yixuan Huang

The underground man thinks that unfettered free choice is opposed to reason, and the free will is restricted by the rationalism and scientific world. He considers that people are absent the spontaneity, and whatever they do, they do not according to their wishes, but according to the laws of nature or rationalism. He compares people to “cog in a wheel” or “keys of a piano” if we are giving up all the free will and become totally rational and claims that people should not be living like that.

The underground man mentions that a person, wherever and whenever he may be, likes to do what he wants to do, and do not like rational interests and ordered him to do what to do; what he is willing to do can be against his personal interests, and sometimes it must be. It may pure belong to the wishes of his own follow one's inclinations, pure belong to his own of even the most tricky and indiscriminate, sometimes is stimulated even of his own insane fantasy, but all these are from his own choice, his own wishes, and his own free will. The underground man challenges that what the basis of all these wise men is that every man needs to have some normal, some virtuous desire, and on what basis they can assume that each person must have some rational, beneficial desire. All a man needs are his desire for independence, no matter what it may cost him to achieve it, and no matter where it may lead him.

Furthermore, the underground man attacks the triumph the crystal palace, which is considered as the ideal expression of human rationality, and in order to attack on rationalism. He considers that the meaning of human existence is defined in the self-assertion of the irrational will.

However, for grand inquisitor, it seems that he contains a different thinking; he takes the exact opposite approach. Grand inquisitor too believes in free will, but he concerns more about the relationship between freedom and the happiness. The poem is about grand inquisitor talks to Jesus, and in this part, it seems that Jesus is the representative of the freedom, and the grand inquisitor describes the appearance of Jesus as became here to hinder the people. Grand inquisitor agrees that these people more than ever to believe that they are completely free, but in fact they give their freedom to him. However, he thinks that it is his, and his men’s merits and achievements: they had finally suppressed freedom and that he had done so in order to make people happy.

The grand inquisitor says that nothing is more intolerable to man and to human society than freedom. And I think that at here, grand inquisitor uses the metaphor; he tries to visualize intangible happiness as "bread", and he supposes that there are only three powers on earth that can forever subdue and capture the conscience of these weak-willed rebels, and make them happy -- miracle, mystery, and authority. The grand inquisitor wants to clarify that the freedom is so important for people than we thought. He mentions a great amount of the shortcoming of human seems to prove, in my opinion, that for human, forced to abandon their own freedom in exchange for “bread” is a better choice, and in giving up the free will, human will become more tame, and is not difficult to control and discipline. Then, people will get the kingdom of peace and happiness. For the grand inquisitor, I may think that he supposes that if we do not build something to restrict the human’s free will, that will be a terrible thing, and human will destroy themselves.

Above all, the underground man emphasizes the importance and necessity of free will, and, in my opinion, what he describes is an absolute freedom; it is not controlled by rationalism, and it seems higher than the moral constraints; the freedom itself, is only controlled through people themselves and their own will. However, the grand inquisitor challenges the underground man, and he supposes that freedom and full bread on the ground cannot be had at the same time, since they will never, ever be good at dividing it among themselves. Without morality, they are rebellious by nature, for they are weak and insignificant. He admits that the freedom of people is given up, but he does not think the free will is the most important thing for human. I think that is the main difference between the underground man and the grand inquisitor.